What knowledge do world history teachers need to teach at the secondary level? The case for epistemic & pedagogic parachutes

Bob Bain
University of Michigan
bbain@umich.edu

@bain_bob  @TeachingWorks

AACTE Conference
#AACTE16
Conclusion: Beginning world history teachers need to be truffle hunters and parachutists
“All historians are either parachutists or truffle-hunters.

The former hangs far above the landscape of the past, looking for general patterns; the latter sink their snouts in the tiniest details preserved in archival documents.

Each has a vital perspective and can often correct the other.”

LaDurie
In our focus on depth studies and on DBQ we’ve ignored the big picture work needed for historical coherence.
Using Document Based Questions with Struggling Readers...
I am a ninth grade teacher in a racially diverse lower income school. My problem is that my students are not great readers but I want to do document-based ...

[PDF] Writing in the History Classroom - School of Humanities
of-view of each document. Finally, the student should be able to identify additional sources that would help answer the question. Strategies for teaching DBQ ...

How To Write Document Based Questions Lesson
"Watch how you can teach a lesson on writing Document-Based Questions for the World History AP Exam. Strategies used includes warm and cool feedback."

The DBQ Project
Engaging inquiry-based units that inspire clear, evidence-based, argument ... The DBQ Project is committed to helping teachers implement rigorous writing and ...

Teaching and Using Document-Based Questions for Middle ...
Levels, Scales or Big Picture Problem

“...[is] establishing the continuity between behavioral explanations sited at the individual level of human experience and those at the level of society and social force. The fundamental problem articulated here is one of linkages.”

Tom Holt
Content needs link and connections
11.1 Students analyze the significant events in the American Revolution and its attempts to realize the philosophy of government in the Declaration of Independence.

1. Describe the Enlightenment and the rise of democracy in the context in which the nation was founded.
2. Analyze the ideological origins of the American Revolution, the debates on the drafting and ratification of the Constitution, and the addition of the Bill of Rights.
3. Understand the history of the Constitution after the Civil War and the industrial revolution, including demographic shifts in the late nineteenth century of the United States.

11.2 Students analyze the relationship among the rise of large-scale rural-to-urban migration, and development in Southern and Eastern Europe.

1. Know the effects of industrialization on living conditions, including the portrayal of working conditions in Upton Sinclair’s The Jungle.
2. Describe the changing landscape, including the linked by industry and trade, the development of cities, the movement of people, and the changing social dynamics.
3. Trace the effect of the Americanization movement.
4. Analyze the effect of urban political machines and social welfare programs on society.
5. Discuss corporate mergers that produced trusts and the rise of corporate power and influence.
6. Trace the economic development of the United States as a major industrial power, including the advantages of its physical geography.
7. Analyze the similarities and differences between Social Darwinism and Social Gospel, and how they were used to justify imperialism.

12.1 Students explain the fundamental principles and moral values of American democracy as expressed in the U.S. Constitution and in the works of European political thinkers such as John Locke, Charles-Louis Montesquieu, Niccolò Machiavelli, and William Blackstone on the development of American government.

1. Discuss the character and promise of American democracy and its debate on the development of American government.
2. Discuss the character of American democracy and its promise and perils as articulated by Alexis de Tocqueville.
3. Explain how the U.S. Constitution reflects a balance between the classical republican concern with promotion of the public good and the classical liberal concern with protecting individual rights; and discuss how the basic premises of liberal constitutionalism and democracy are joined in the Declaration of Independence as “self-evident truths.”

4. Explain how the Founding Fathers’ realistic view of human nature led to the establishment of a constitutional system that limited the power of the governors and the governed as articulated in the Federalist Papers.
5. Describe the systems of separated and shared powers, the role of organized interests (Federalist Paper Number 10), checks and balances (Federalist Paper Number 51), the importance of an independent judiciary (Federalist Paper Number 78), enumerated powers, rule of law, federalism, and civilian control of the military.

6. Understand that the Bill of Rights limits the powers of the federal government and state governments.

12.2 Students evaluate and take positions on the scope and limits of rights and obligations as democratic citizens, the relationships among them, and how they are secured.

1. Discuss the meaning and importance of each of the rights guaranteed under the Bill of Rights and how each is secured (e.g., freedom of religion, freedom of speech, habeas corpus, etc.).
Foster, Ashby & Lee

• Studying frameworks
• Students work with pictures and cards
• Organize and describe
• Findings:
  • Event-like reasoning
  • Process-like
Event-like reasoning

Medieval times, Battle of Hastings 1066, William of Normandy, Shakespeare, King Weard, Henry VII and his 8 wives Tudors, Stuarts, Queen Elizabeth, Victoria, Elizabeth 2nd, World War 1 & 2, Jack the ripper, Margaret Thatcher, Gulf War, Cold War, Vietcong, Vietnam, nuclear bombs, Hollywood, cinema, cars, planes, the moon, space travel, Tony Blair, George Bush, Iraq war, terrorism, Euro all currency in Europe except [U.K.].

Foster et al. 2008: 26
Causation

“Most historians will go to some lengths to avoid ‘monocausal explanation’. Almost all historians are used to the idea that historical events . . . have several sufficient as well as necessary causes, any one of which might have been enough to trigger the event on its own. Generally, however, they see it as their duty to establish a hierarchy of causes and to explain if relevant the relationship of one cause to another.”

Richard Evans, *In Defense of History*
Carretaro, et al.

- Card sorts -- causation
- Five causes
  - Political
  - Remote
  - Ideological
  - International
  - Personal
- Different events
- 5th graders - MAs
  psych & history
Discovery of America

**Personalistic**: Personal motives of Columbus and Spanish King & Queen

**Political**: Formation of powerful Spanish nation-state

**Economic**: Search for new commercial route

**Remote**: Growth of scientific knowledge, new means of navigation (compass, astrolabe)

**Ideological**: Legends, myths, stories of explorers stirred up curiosity

**International**: Portuguese voyages to Africa
Findings.

- Personal trumped all
- No real change, 5th grade to MA
- *Except* History MAs
  - Situated Personal
  - Contextualized by event
Missing perspective
# BHP-World History Frame

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th></th>
<th>Age of Foragers</th>
<th>Agrarian Age</th>
<th>Modern Age</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td><strong>Years</strong></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Dominant system of producing goods &amp; services</strong></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Way of distributing goods &amp; services</strong></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Forms of energy</strong></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Modes of Communication</strong></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Groups in which people live</strong></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
### Modes of Production Frame

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>YEARS AGO</th>
<th>HOW DO YOU SPEND YOUR TIME?</th>
<th>WHAT DO YOU EAT?</th>
<th>HOW LONG DO YOU LIVE?</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>60,000</td>
<td>FORAGER: you look for roots and berries, small animals, shellfish, snails and grubs. This takes most of your time.</td>
<td>Whatever you can find that you can digest. Often you eat very little.</td>
<td>You may be killed at birth. If not, you are likely to die before 5 years of age and are unlikely to live past 30.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>15,000</td>
<td>HUNTER-GATHERER: if female, you still look for roots and grubs. If male, you hunt big game in a group of 50–100 people. You all follow the big animals as they move around. This takes a few hours per day: you have lots of leisure time.</td>
<td>When lucky you eat meat. When times are hard, it’s back to roots and snails. When unlucky, you starve or eat other people.</td>
<td>You’re a bit more likely to get to 30. If sick or injured you’re likely to be left behind to starve or be eaten.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>7,000</td>
<td>FARMER: you herd animals and protect them; sow, weed and gather crops; bake bread; make porridge and weak beer. A few of you with specialist knowledge and skills make baskets, pottery and cloth. This takes nearly all your time: you have little leisure.</td>
<td>When lucky you eat meat and drink milk. Every day you eat bread, beans and porridge. You store food to get you through hard times.</td>
<td>More, but not many, of you live to 30 or 40. You may recover from injuries and sickness but are more likely to get sick or be killed in warfare or in house fires.</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

| 150       | INDUSTRIAL WORKER: you go to work in a factory or a mine (women and men, boys and girls). You make bricks, machines, clothes and other things we still have today. You have a few hours a week for leisure and a few days a year at the seaside. There are still lots of farmers but you’re more likely to work in a factory than on the land. | You eat meat, bread, fresh vegetables and fruit. You drink tea and eat or have things brought from other countries. As long as you can work and earn money you can always buy food and beer. | Most of you will live into your forties but disease is a big killer, especially of children under 5. If you get old or infirm and have no family willing or able to look after you, you’re unlikely to live long. |

| NOW       | SERVICE WORKER: you go to work in a shop, office or restaurant. You teach, nurse, write, solve difficult sums or use computers. A few of you even grow food and have a free lunch and a free break. There are still lots of farmers who grow food and industrial workers who make everything from electricity to paper cups, but you’re more likely to work in an office than on the land or in a factory. You have so much leisure you’re often bored. | You eat junk food and fun food which you buy in take-aways or heat up from frozen. You eat meat (and drink) far too much. You rarely feel hungry and are more likely to be overweight than starving. | Most of you can expect to live past 70 or 80... unless something goes wrong! We get almost all our food from overseas AND world population is growing fast. SO WHAT COULD GO WRONG? Will there be enough roots and grubs if we need them? |

Shemilt, 2013
## Columbus and Flat Earth

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Year</th>
<th>How was Columbus viewed in colonies or USA? Evidence?</th>
<th>What changed?</th>
<th>What’s happening in US?</th>
<th>What’s Happening in the world?</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>1492</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1592</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1692</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1792</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1892</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1992</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Bain, 2005
Beginning world history teachers must explicitly and intentionally shift their scales/levels of analysis and create cognitive tools to help students.

My conclusion. . .
TE challenges

• Make scale and levels thinking visible
• Explicitly and intentionally “scale” shift – make parachutists and truffle-hunters teachers personas
• Identify signature and effective pedagogical tools and practices
• Make these public, with evidence of their impact.
Privileging the macro level . . . yields atrophied, lifeless, passionless depictions [of human history]

Isolating micro-level phenomena, on the other hand, renders human behavior simply unknowable.

Holt, 1995, p.100
Thanks

Bob Bain
University of Michigan
✉ bbain@umich.edu
🐦 @bain_bob
🐦 @BigHistoryPro

www.bighistoryproject.com