Information for the November 22, 2013 TeachingWorks Journal Club Meeting

We will discuss the following two articles in this meeting:


In addition, bibliographic information is below for other relevant articles published in the following journals since the August 1, 2013 meeting and until October 15, 2013.¹

Journal of Teacher Education
American Educational Research Journal
Elementary School Journal
Journal of Curriculum Studies
Teachers College Record
Educational Evaluation and Policy Analysis
Teaching and Teacher Education
Journal of Education for Teaching: International Research and Pedagogy


This article addresses the challenges PDS partnerships face as they go to scale. Based on Coburn's (2005) notions of scale, the article uses organizational theory to analyze data from a ten-year qualitative meta-synthesis of PDS partnership research. Based upon the analysis, the article offers four recommendations: PDS partnerships should sustain strong trajectories of research regarding their work; Stakeholders in PDS partnerships need to ensure that faculty and staff have adequate support to thrive; PDS partnerships need to be based upon enabling bureaucratic structures; and PDS partners need to create opportunities to engage with each other in positive, normative spaces.


The purpose of this investigation was to explore the influence of video models on teacher candidates' capacity to self-evaluate their teaching performance in early fieldwork. This was examined by providing video models along with evaluation rubrics that represented desired performance standard to one group of pre-service teacher candidates, while another group was provided the descriptions of these lessons and corresponding evaluation rubrics. Participants then video recorded their teaching and self-evaluated this performance. Results indicated that the introduction of video models reduced inflation of scores in self-evaluation and enhanced candidates' understanding of the expectations for the performance assessment of teaching.

¹ For the November 22, 2013 TeachingWorks journal club we considered the following journals: Journal of Teacher Education (September/October 2013, 64(4)); American Educational Research Journal (October 2013, 50(5)); Elementary School Journal (September 2013, 114(1)); Journal of Curriculum Studies (no issues were published between 8/1/13 and 10/15/13); Teachers College Record (115(8), 115(9), 115(10)); Educational Evaluation and Policy Analysis (no issues were published between 8/1/13 and 10/15/13); Teaching and Teacher Education (November 2013, 36); Journal of Education for Teaching: International Research and Pedagogy (2013, 39(4)).

Previous research suggests that elementary teachers vary in their enactment of science curriculum materials and may not always engage students in substantive sense making. This mixed-methods study investigates elementary teachers' use of science curriculum materials to engage students in the scientific practice of comparing and evaluating evidence-based explanations. We asked (1) How do in-service elementary teachers use existing science curriculum materials to engage students in comparing and evaluating evidence-based explanations? and (2) What do their instructional design practices reveal about their pedagogical reasoning for engaging students in comparing and evaluating evidence-based explanations? Our results suggest that comparing and evaluating explanations was the least-emphasized feature of inquiry in these teachers' planned and enacted science instruction. Though the teachers made small adjustments that better engaged students in the practice, their curriculum materials and ideas about comparing and evaluating evidence-based explanations limited the impact of their curriculum design decisions on students' sense-making opportunities.


This inquiry explores teachers' perspectives on enacting environmental education in a Quebec urban locale with high student diversity. Participating in focus groups and interviews, teachers from three schools discussed their experiences incorporating environmental education into their multicultural-diverse classrooms. Challenges included value clashes, a lack of common lived experiences, and reconciling contradictory educational perspectives and political policies, which often placed teachers in paradoxical positions. Findings suggest moving toward practices of culturally-responsive environmental education that demand more than awareness but include interactive dialogue. Teachers need support from beyond the classroom and the capacity to develop curriculum facilitating the inclusion of students' culture.


This article reports on a study on the use of the target language (TL) in foreign language classrooms, drawing on the perspectives of student teachers and practising teachers. Observational and group discussion data showed that TL use was not extensive. While student teachers and practising teachers shared a commitment to using the TL, this was undermined by several factors, notably inconsistencies between university and school positions on TL use, challenging classes, external inspection and examinations. Lack of coherence between student teachers' experiences at university and in schools has implications not only for languages but also other subjects in teacher preparation.


Proposals made by the European Commission in 2007 led to the Education Council adopting, for the first time, a European agenda for improving the quality of teaching and teacher education. This article reports on a small-scale longitudinal interview-based study with teachers in England, Norway and Germany demonstrating that while opportunities for professional development are increasing in all three countries, dissatisfaction is expressed by most teachers in relation to its quality and outcomes.


A rationale for providing high-quality support during teachers' early years is to develop further the skills teachers acquire during preparation and to help overcome weaknesses that might lead them to abandon the profession. Yet, almost no consideration has been given to potential
interactions between preservice preparation and induction support received. This study utilizes survey and administrative data to examine the effects, including interactions, of preservice preparation and early career support on new teachers' career intentions and decisions. Consistent with previous research, we find a direct association between perceived preparation quality and leaving teaching. Moreover, we find the quality and comprehensiveness of mentoring and induction to be related to teachers’ intentions and decisions. Our results also suggest that comprehensive support moderates the relationship between preservice preparation and intentions to leave. The findings point to the importance of considering preservice preparation in combination with induction support in efforts to address teacher attrition.

In response to the existing accountability movement in the United States, a plethora of educational policies and standards have emerged at various levels to promote teacher assessment competency, with a focus on preservice assessment education. However, despite these policies and standards, research has shown that beginning teachers continue to maintain low competency levels in assessment. Limited assessment education that is potentially misaligned to assessment standards and classroom practices has been identified as one factor contributing to a lack of assessment competency. Accordingly, the purpose of this study was to analyze the alignment between teacher education accreditation policies, professional standards for teacher assessment practice, and preservice assessment course curriculum. Through a curriculum alignment methodology involving two policy documents, two professional standards documents, and syllabi from 10 Florida-based, Council for Accreditation of Teacher Education–certified teacher education programs, the results of this study serve to identify points of alignment and misalignment across policies, standards, and curricula. The study concludes with a discussion on the current state of assessment education with implications for enhancing teacher preparation in this area and future research on assessment education.

Teacher evaluation systems play an important role in teachers' professional development. This study examines which components of an evaluation system are related to the effects of the evaluation system on professional development from a teachers' perspective. Components such as leadership characteristics, the purpose of evaluation and features of the evaluation system are included in the study. Data regarding a representative sample of 1983 teachers from 65 Flemish schools were collected by questionnaire. The outcomes of multilevel analyses suggest that limited experience (<5 years) and useful feedback are positively related to outcomes of the teacher evaluation system on professional development.

The present study examined the development of teacher identity in a cohort of first year student teachers from a developmental and social psychological perspective, relying on Erikson's (1964) theory of identity development and Turner, Oakes, Haslam, and McGarty's (1994) self-categorization theory. As hypothesized, aspects of both personal identity development and social identity were significantly associated with higher teacher identity after controlling for several covariates. The findings have several implications for teacher education programs and point to the potential utility of applying well-researched psychological theory when examining the processes by which student teachers develop a professional teaching identity.

This article questions the status of two recurring concepts in teacher preparation: resistance and ignorance. Both of these terms have significant presence within the teacher education literature.
Because both of these terms often occur in relation to a particular topic, that of race and multicultural education, we also utilize race as the discourse that frames our consideration of these two important issues. To reframe and reorient our attention to the processes of ignorance and resistance, we turn to psychoanalytic considerations of those terms and consider what such a turn can offer teacher educators as they engage teacher candidates with issues of race.

Hall, D. & Jones, L. (2013). "Social class (in)visibility and the professional experiences of middle-class novice teachers." *Journal of Education for Teaching* 39(4): 416-428. This article focuses upon the classed and early professional experiences of middle-class novice teachers in England experiencing and contemplating working in schools serving socio-economically disadvantaged communities. Through an examination of the visibility and invisibility of social class in education set within an increasingly unequal and changed social landscape, the article reports upon research which seeks to better understand the class identities of these teachers. Evidence is presented of the key, yet complex, role that social class occupies within the working lives of new teachers and reveals the different ways in which teachers respond to the classed dimensions of their early professional experiences. It is concluded that the fundamentally important role that social class plays in terms of shaping early professional experiences in teaching suggests the need not only for a commensurately enhanced focus as part of early professional development, but also for attention that is sensitively attuned to the class identities of teachers.

Henning, N. (2013). "We make the road by walking together: New teachers and the collaborative and context-specific appropriation of shared social justice-oriented practices and concepts." *Teaching and Teacher Education* 36: 121-131. This study examined the work of a collaborative group of six new United States-based social studies teachers from the same social justice-oriented teacher education program (SJOTEP). Shared practices and concepts introduced previously in the SJOTEP were developed and appropriated to their classrooms and schools in consideration of the local context, through the collaborative problem-solving process of the group. It is argued that SJOTEPs and TEPs committed to issues of diversity, democracy, inclusion, and/or equity should be collaboration-based, teach a coherent and consistent social justice-focused curriculum, and provide post-graduation collaborative support and research it.

Howe, E.R. & Xu, S. (2013). "Transcultural teacher development within the dialectic of the global and local: Bridging gaps between East and West." *Teaching and Teacher Education* 36: 33-43. Amid far-reaching global social and economic changes, increasing diversity and growing interdependency, teachers play important roles in creating successful futures for both individuals and society. Within the dialectic of global and local, and with increasing connectivity amongst teachers, opportunities for transformational learning fostering empathy, global citizenship, and social justice are unprecedented. Thus, teacher education reform should facilitate transcultural collaboration, collegiality and critical perspectives to counter Western hegemony of knowledge, Eurocentric education, neo-colonialism, and neoliberal/conservative agendas. This paper investigates these issues and teachers' personal practical and professional knowledge through narratives of West-to-East and East-to-West transcultural journeys as teacher educators.

Hung, H.-T. & Yeh, H.-C. (2013). "Forming a change environment to encourage professional development through a teacher study group." *Teaching and Teacher Education* 36: 153-165. This study is grounded in the context of English-as-a-Foreign-Language (EFL) teacher education in Taiwan and aims to promote the potential of teacher study groups. The Interconnected Model of Teacher Professional Growth provides a framework to design this teacher study group and to analyze the learning process as experienced by the participating teachers within the collaborative inquiry. The study illustrates the group's learning process by characterizing the major patterns of the teachers' changes in beliefs and practices. The results support the claim that the design of the teacher study groups plays a major role in shaping various sequences of teacher change.

Background/Context: This piece draws on literature in justice-oriented teacher education, feminist pedagogy, and postmodern notions of bodies and place to make sense of data generated from a three-year study of an undergraduate teacher education course. A feminist lens was used to engage a body- and place-focused pedagogy that aimed to engage students in recognizing themselves as full-bodied and cultured beings who can work to better understand and expand their perceptions of themselves and others in place.

Purpose: The authors argue that postmodern theories of bodies and place can provide complex insights for both theorizing and practicing teacher education. Readers have the opportunity to experience alternative community-based teacher education practice through a graphic presentation and consider both the theoretical and practice implications in the broader field of education.

Research Design: This three-year study is an arts-based qualitative inquiry into the experiences of a course where feminist and postmodern notions of bodies and place informed the pedagogical decision-making of their professor (Stephanie Jones). Data were generated across three years and those focused specifically on or around the community bus ride were used to ask questions about how bodies and places interact with one another to produce sense-making about people, places, and the purposes of education. As part of the inquiry, Stephanie produced visual images in comics-form presenting pedagogical interactions and experiences that illuminated theoretical insights and then engaged Jim in conversations and sketch-sharing about theory and practice related to the data and how it was experienced in real-time by Stephanie. After numerous conversations looking over each panel and analytical discussions about bodies, place, and pedagogies as they were produced on the page and multiple revisions of both images and print text, Stephanie and Jim settled on the graphic production published here as both a representation of the research and a provocation for reimagining teacher education practice and scholarship.

Conclusions: The study is an example of how pedagogies informed by theoretical understandings of bodies and place can produce practices that help teacher education students recognize their bodies as central sites for critical change inside and outside institutions. Tending to, documenting, and discussing their bodily-ways-of-being in different places and how bodies/places produce perceptions of others were powerful practices that helped students think deeply about power and their roles as future teachers.


This article reports a research project planned and organized by the School of Educational Studies of Universiti Sains Malaysia to provide an international teaching practicum experience to six pre-service teachers for six weeks in Maldives. Using qualitative data from an open-ended questionnaire and reflective journals, the six pre-service teachers' experience of professional development during their international teaching practicum is examined, analysed and described. The findings show that the six students experienced beneficial and meaningful professional development. Some challenges and limitations of the international practicum are also highlighted. Based on this study, implications for teacher education/training of TESOL/TESL teachers are suggested.


Meta-analysis comprises a powerful tool for synthesizing prior research and empirically validating theoretical frameworks. Using this tool and the dynamic model of educational effectiveness as a guiding framework, in this paper we present a meta-analysis of 167 studies investigating the impact of teaching factors on student achievement. The factors of the dynamic model were found to be moderately associated with student achievement; in contrast, factors not included in the model were weakly associated with student learning, with the exception of two factors associated with constructivism. In discussing the study findings, we consider their theoretical, methodological, and practical implications.

Teachers' responses to language classroom incidents depend on many factors, including the extent of their teaching experience. The question of how much influence teaching experience carries is important given that pre-service teachers have had limited opportunities to respond to day-to-day incidents that arise in classrooms. This paper reports on a two-stage research study in Singapore that first explored 22 pre-service teachers' understandings of language classroom incidents and their possible responses. Subsequently, a survey was conducted to compare pre-service and in-service teachers' perceptions about anticipating and responding to classroom incidents. The findings from a total of 77 respondents indicate that perceptions of the experienced and inexperienced teachers are similar in many ways, yet some notable differences emerged as well as a few interesting individual responses. This work has implications for initial teacher education programmes in terms of considering the value of providing pre-service teachers with opportunities to discuss and reflect on potential language classroom incidents.


Pre-service teacher training has been identified as one of the key factors in the promotion of inclusive education. In this study, 200 final-year pre-service teachers from three colleges of education in Ghana were surveyed about their views and knowledge on inclusive education and special educational needs (SEN). The results showed that almost all of the participants had been introduced to the concept of inclusion during their studies. However, only one-third felt highly, or somewhat, prepared to teach children with SEN. The level of knowledge and feelings of self-efficacy were highest among those pre-service teachers who had personal experience of supporting children with SEN during their practicum. The participants tended to prefer those inclusive instructional strategies that were easiest to apply in general education classrooms. Significant differences in the outcomes were found between the three colleges studied indicating strong effects of the teacher education model applied in each college.


This study examines the extent to which the quality of mentoring and its frequency during the first years of teaching influence teachers' professional competence and well-being. Analyses are based on a sample of more than 700 German beginning mathematics teachers who participated in a pre-test/post-test study over the course of one year. Findings indicate that it is the quality of mentoring rather than its frequency that explains a successful career start. In particular, mentoring that follows constructivist rather than transmissive principles of learning fosters the growth of teacher efficacy, teaching enthusiasm, and job satisfaction and reduces emotional exhaustion.


Some believe the solution to improving instructional quality in K-12 schools lies in identifying and recruiting certain kinds of individuals to the profession (e.g., academically talented, stronger commitment). Others believe that talented or committed individuals cannot become effective or enduring teachers without adequate preparation. Most prior literature examines either recruitment or preparation, rather than weighing evidence for both simultaneously. In addition, most prior research investigates the effects of either approach on only a single outcome, rather than considering multiple outcomes at once. Drawing on pre- and poststudent teaching surveys of more than 1,000 prospective teachers in a large, urban district, this study uses a unique strategy to disentangle the effects of one dimension of preparation (student teaching) from the effects of teacher characteristics on a number of measures for teachers’ self-perceived instructional quality and career plans. The findings indicate that career plans are more often related to teacher
characteristics, whereas self-perceived instructional quality is more often related to features of clinical preparation. Implications for recruitment and preparation are discussed.


Despite the popularity of professional learning communities (PLCs) among researchers, practitioners, and educational policy makers, studies on PLCs differ significantly on the dimensions and capacities used to conceptualize them. Further, the interrelatedness of different dimensions and capacities within PLCs is not often well conceived nor examined in terms of learning at multiple (individual, team, school) levels. In an effort to address this gap, this study assesses the multidimensional, multilevel nature of PLCs using data from 992 teachers from 76 Dutch elementary schools. Findings indicate that professional learning communities within elementary schools can be conceptualized and assessed by 3 strongly interconnected capacities that are represented by 8 underlying dimensions. This conceptual structure empirically emerged as equivalent at both the teacher and school levels. By providing increased insight into the multidimensional, multilevel nature of the concept of PLCs, this article aims to add conceptual clarity to the study of PLCs in elementary education.


Background/Context: For years mentoring has been promoted as an essential element of effective induction programs. Since research reports of the impact of mentoring have been uneven, it is critical to closely examine the complex aspects that could affect the ways teachers enact ideas into the practice of mentoring. This study is about mentor teacher learning that supports beginning teacher development. This research examines two teachers as they learned to mentor toward a targeted practice of helping novices lead discussions.

Purpose: The purpose of this research is to understand features of complexity that could influence how two induction mentors in the same district, and who participated in the same university-based professional development enacted the ideas and practices in different ways. The mentoring professional development targeted the high-leverage practice of helping beginning teachers learn to lead classroom discussions. Specifically, we examine features of the activity settings that influenced how two mentors enacted their work. We explore the question, why are two mentor teachers, who are experiencing the same professional development and scaffolded learning opportunities, enacting their practice differently?

Research Design: In this longitudinal descriptive case study, data from two mentors' work with beginning teachers collected over a two-year period, revealed variations in the ways that these mentors talked about and used new ideas. Activity theory provided a lens to examine mentor cases to see how individual and contextual factors related to identity and authority intersected and influenced mentors' learning and the implementation of a new practice. Key features of activity settings used to analyze data are that they have histories, are goal-oriented, and involve culturally shared language and tools linked to issues of identity and authority.

Conclusions/Recommendations: Understanding ways in which two mentors implemented a new practice in their school context revealed complexities in learning to mentor in ways that may shift the way we think about preparing mentors. We suggest that identity and authority influenced role enactment. Two issues emerge from these cases that have implications for professional development providers, educators and researchers: (a) mentor learning and growing authority in promoting reform-based practices, and (b) preparing mentors for a more powerful role in enacting reform-oriented practices in schools.


Professional Development Schools (PDS) have been established to realise supportive and stimulating environments for practice-based research activities for both teachers and student teachers. The questions investigated in this study concerned the perceptions of experienced
teachers and student teachers with respect to different aspects of practice-based research in PDS and non-PDS settings and to what degree these perceptions differed. For this purpose, the Questionnaire on Teacher Research was developed. Respondents (N=102) were asked for their perceptions of the research environment, their research motives, the research process and perceived (learning) outcomes. The questionnaire appeared to be a valid, reliable and sensitive instrument.

This paper discusses the pedagogical learning of some South African pre-service teachers during a practicum in 'special' schools. Besides promoting their understanding of diversity, these pre-service teachers noticed aspects of pedagogy that had been less visible to them during previous practicum sessions in 'mainstream' schools. An analysis of focus group interviews, Facebook posts, and journal entries suggests that their attention was drawn to the value of multiple representations of core concepts, lesson pacing and behavior management in responding to learning differences. Observing and teaching in special schools enabled some tacit aspects of their developing practice to become more explicit.

This study investigated how an online community of teachers engaged in professional development using collaborative Web (Web 2.0) technologies. This community of practice (CoP) consisted of world language (WL) teachers using the microblogging platform, Twitter. The study approached teacher learning from a sociocultural perspective. Its central questions were as follows: What are the characteristics of this CoP of WL educators on Twitter? How do those characteristics relate to or reflect teacher learning? With a qualitative, netnographic approach, data sources included over a year of participant observation, nine interviews with community members, and numerous online documents from blogs, wikis, and other sources. Findings demonstrated how the domain, community, and practice characteristics of this online CoP could also be linked to sustained and significant teacher learning. The study concludes with considerations for the future of similar online communities.

Research conducted by teacher educators is considered important for their professional development, their actual teaching practice and their body of knowledge. However, for many teacher educators in Universities of Applied Sciences (UAS) in the Netherlands, research is a new challenge. A survey was conducted among 508 such teacher educators exploring their perceptions towards research. They were questioned about the aims of research within a UAS, their perceived capabilities to conduct research and their need for support. Subsequently, 10 teacher educators were interviewed to elaborate on the findings and to gain further insight. Research is considered vital for their professional development, and their development is seen as an important means to improve the quality of the curriculum for teacher education. Teacher educators emphasise the need for communities of inquiry in which they can collaborate on research, improve their skills, develop a shared language and contribute to the body of knowledge in teacher education.
Summary:


Abstract:
This article addresses the challenges PDS partnerships face as they go to scale. Based on Coburn's (2005) notions of scale, the article uses organizational theory to analyze data from a ten-year qualitative meta-synthesis of PDS partnership research. Based upon the analysis, the article offers four recommendations: PDS partnerships should sustain strong trajectories of research regarding their work; Stakeholders in PDS partnerships need to ensure that faculty and staff have adequate support to thrive; PDS partnerships need to be based upon enabling bureaucratic structures; and PDS partners need to create opportunities to engage with each other in positive, normative spaces.

Summary Prepared by Barry Fishman & Liz Keren-Kolb

The basic claim of this article is that, although there has been much research on professional development schools (PDS), there has been little progress towards defining the conditions needed to make PDS sustainable or scalable. The author argues that the PDS model of teacher education is not scalable because of some basic conflicts between the demands and structure of university and K-12 organizations. The author points to Coburn's (2003) framework for "rethinking scale" as a roadmap for possibly repairing this, though the article is not optimistic about the chances for doing so (we believe that the author's citation is incorrect, and that Adair Breault is citing Coburn (2003)). The correct citation is:


PDS Definition: "A Professional Development School (PDS) Partnership is a collaborative relationship between a university and a school and/or district designed to simultaneously renew schools and teacher education programmes (Teitel, 1999)" (p. 92).

PDS partnerships generally support four broad aims:
1. Preparing pre-service teachers in field-based experience
2. Supporting in-service teachers in partnering schools
3. Reforming teacher education
4. Improving student achievement

Methods and Analysis
This is a theoretical piece. The evidentiary base for assessments of the state of PDS is based on a "qualitative meta-syntheses" of 350 PDS studies spanning more than 20 years. The meta-syntheses were the subject of earlier publications by Adair Breault.

These are the arguments presented by the author about challenges that limit the scalability of PDS efforts:

- As PDSs attempt to go to scale, they will (logically) encounter greater numbers of "teachers that are resistant to change" (p. 94), thus making the effort progressively more difficult.
- The operational goals of teacher education programs are driven by the operational goals of universities. To the extent that universities are focused on profit and prestige (and she claims that we are), this undermines the goals of the PDS.
• The growing “intensification of the professorate” (p. 95), in the form of raised expectations for tenure and longer working hours creates a “role conflict” that limits our ability to be good partners.

• A conflict between the demands of high-quality research and the kinds of research teachers in PDSs want/need: “...you cannot scale-up a PDS without scaling-up the level of meaningful inquiry that is taking place within those PDS partnerships. As Ball and Forrani [sic] (2007) argue, ‘Schools of education should acknowledge a special responsibility to produce disciplined knowledge in education’ (p. 537). Therefore, all professors involved in PDS work should be expected to inform the field as well. Thus, while story-telling and simple studies may be important to PDS faculty liaisons, they are not sufficient without meaningful research regarding the complex nature of PDS partnerships” (p. 95).

• PDS partnerships “are based upon collaboration, but both teaching and teacher education are isolating work” (p. 95). The workload of PDS will make it hard for junior faculty to collaborate with senior colleagues, and, in any event, universities don’t support that kind of collaboration. Also, teachers in schools are hostile to theory, so they don’t want to collaborate with university personnel on the research.

Conclusions
Adair Breault presents Coburn’s framework—that rethinks what scale means—as providing guideposts towards a way forward. Below we list Coburn’s four elements along with the argument about what is needed in each for PDS to succeed, according to the author:

1. Depth – Deep engagement requires real change on the part of both parties in a PDS partnership. “Institutional isomorphism” (p. 97) can lead to the replication of existing structures of schools and universities, without any attempt at deep or meaningful change.
2. Sustainability – You cannot talk about scale if you cannot first address sustainability (at small scale). Without significant belief change (see Depth), sustainable change is unlikely.
3. Spread – For a PDS model to scale up, there needs to be spread “not only to more classrooms but also to more practices within the current classrooms, schools, and teacher education classes” (p. 97).
4. Ownership – The ownership of reforms must shift from external to internal—so that changes are sustained even throughout leadership changes.

The article closes with four key recommendations for PDS partnerships:

1. “…stakeholders in PDS partnerships need to ensure that they are supporting a strong trajectory of research about the partnership” (p. 98).
2. “…stakeholders need to ensure that the faculty and staff involved in PDS partnerships have adequate support to thrive” (p. 99).
3. “…PDS stakeholders should strive to create and sustain enabling bureaucratic structures to preserve innovation within their partnerships” (p. 99).
4. “…university and school-based PDS stakeholders need to create opportunities to engage with each other in positive, normative space” (p. 99).

Commentary
Though we like Coburn’s framework in general, we also feel that it doesn’t do sufficient “work” towards providing actionable solutions to the issues Adair Breault raises in her argument. We therefore offer a different framework that Adair Breault might have used to examine the research-practice partnership inherent in PDS work: Design-Based Implementation Research (DBIR; Penuel, Fishman, Cheng, & Sabelli, 2011). DBIR is meant to re-frame the way collaborations or partnerships go about undertaking joint work so that the product of that collaboration is more scalable and sustainable from the outset.

DBIR is based on four core principles:
1. A focus on persistent problems of practice from multiple stakeholders’ perspectives;
2. A commitment to iterative, collaborative design;
3. A concern with developing theory and knowledge related to both classroom learning and implementation through systematic inquiry; and
4. A concern with developing capacity for sustaining change in systems.
The ideas in DBIR build upon Coburn's (2003) revised notion of scale and represent a pathway to a more productive partnership.

**Discussion Question:**
*How do the organizational challenges described in this paper relate to the school partnership(s) of the School of Education in our teacher preparation work? What caution (or comfort) should we take?*
Summary:


Abstract:
This study investigated how an online community of teachers engaged in professional development using collaborative Web (Web 2.0) technologies. This community of practice (CoP) consisted of world language (WL) teachers using the microblogging platform, Twitter. The study approached teacher learning from a sociocultural perspective. Its central questions were as follows: What are the characteristics of this CoP of WL educators on Twitter? How do those characteristics relate to or reflect teacher learning? With a qualitative, netnographic approach, data sources included over a year of participant observation, nine interviews with community members, and numerous online documents from blogs, wikis, and other sources. Findings demonstrated how the domain, community, and practice characteristics of this online CoP could also be linked to sustained and significant teacher learning. The study concludes with considerations for the future of similar online communities.

Summary prepared by Liz Keren-Kolb and Barry Fishman

The basic claim of this article is that web-based collaborative “grassroots” technologies can embody the characteristics of Wenger’s (1998) communities of practice (CoPs) for teacher professional development. The author conducts an ethnography with a group of world language teachers using Twitter to evaluate this claim.

The Role of the Study
1. In the past, the study of web-based CoPs has had some form of controlled institutional oversight. Wesely’s study considered a “grassroots” CoP and looked at potential teacher learning.
2. Attends to how teachers understand their experiences and place within the Twitter community and beyond.

Method
This was a qualitative study using computer-mediated data of a “grassroots” online CoP with nine world language teachers (Twitter). The author was a participant-observer in the community. The study was conducted as a netnography (online fieldwork).

Table 1. Characteristics of Interview Participants at the Time of the Interview (May 2011).

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Participant</th>
<th>Language</th>
<th>U.S. Region</th>
<th>Years FL teaching</th>
<th>Number of colleagues in school teaching same language</th>
<th>Other languages taught in school</th>
<th>No. of tweets (rounded up to nearest 500)</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>P1</td>
<td>French</td>
<td>Midwest</td>
<td>16</td>
<td>0</td>
<td>Spanish</td>
<td>4,600</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>P2</td>
<td>French</td>
<td>South</td>
<td>25</td>
<td>0</td>
<td>Spanish, ASL</td>
<td>6,500</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>P3</td>
<td>Spanish</td>
<td>Midwest</td>
<td>20</td>
<td>2</td>
<td>None</td>
<td>2,000</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>P4</td>
<td>Spanish</td>
<td>Midwest</td>
<td>4</td>
<td>0</td>
<td>German</td>
<td>500</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>P5</td>
<td>Spanish</td>
<td>Northeast</td>
<td>10</td>
<td>4</td>
<td>French, Japanese</td>
<td>1,500</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>P6</td>
<td>French</td>
<td>Midwest</td>
<td>11</td>
<td>0</td>
<td>Spanish</td>
<td>2,500</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>P7</td>
<td>Spanish</td>
<td>Midwest</td>
<td>19</td>
<td>0</td>
<td>None</td>
<td>2,000</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>P8</td>
<td>Spanish</td>
<td>West</td>
<td>7</td>
<td>6</td>
<td>French, Japanese</td>
<td>1,500</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>P9</td>
<td>French</td>
<td>West</td>
<td>28</td>
<td>1</td>
<td>German, Spanish</td>
<td>1,000</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Note: ASL = American Sign Language.
*P4 worked on a weekly basis with Spanish teachers in the other district schools.

Table reproduced from Wesely (2013) p. 309.
Data Collection
1. Interviews (one interview per participant)
   a. What type of training or education did you have in foreign language education? (p. 309)
   b. Describe to me some of your online relationships in your professional community. (p. 309)
   c. Have you noticed any changes in how you teach language since communicating in this online professional community, like what? (p. 309)
   d. What advice would you give teacher educators about your online community? (p. 309)
2. Participant observation (Oct 2010-April 2011)
3. Logging tweets
4. Hashtag observation
5. Documenting shared resources with online bookmarking tool

Research Framework
Wesely draws upon the following research concerning the difficulties and potential benefits for professional development in online communities of practice:

- Researchers have questioned whether teacher learning can truly occur in the online context, given a lack of connection or progression that some argue is endemic to Web-mediated interactions (Zhang, 2009).
- There is a need for researchers to consider informal online networks for professional teachers of in-service educators (Lieberman and Mace, 2010).
- Examine the possibilities inherent in professional learning from the “ground up” and the “important directive power emerging from participating teachers.”
- There is an argument for greater benefits when using self-directed professional development over mandated professional development (Burns & Richards, 2009).
- Challenges in online learning
  - Researchers have asked whether online contexts support knowledge sharing but not learning (Zhang, 2009).
- Teacher Learning is situated in Communities of Practice.
  - “Groups of people who share a concern or passion for something they do and learn how to do it better” (Wenger, 1998)
  - Three characteristics of Communities of Practice (CoP):
    - Common domain, shared commitment and competence among community members;
    - Community members build relationships and have regular interaction; and
    - Community members have a shared practice (sustained interaction of building shared knowledge).

Findings
The three characteristics of Wenger’s CoPs (domain, community, and practice, elaborated below) are present in the world language teachers group on Twitter. We describe how Wesely defends her claims that the three characteristics of Wenger’s CoPs were present in her findings.

1. Domain
   - Wesely found that the WL teachers hold a shared commitment and competence around WL.
   - The WL teachers hold expertise and competence with technology.
   - The WL teachers are actively seeking technology for practice.
   - The Domain as a Reflection of Learning
     - Idea of being “learners” embraced by CoP
     - Clear line between teachers who participated in Twitter and those that did not

2. Community
   - The WL teachers had a general feeling of professional isolation at their K-12 schools.
   - Joining Twitter felt like a move from an “isolated” teaching community to an active and shared CoP.
The Community as a Site of Learning

- Teachers were learning from each other by sharing and being made aware of new resources which led to a shift in their teaching behavior (such as many went “paperless”).
- Learning was a byproduct of participation.

3. Practice (sustained interactions and sharing of ideas that contribute to the knowledge base)

- The WL teachers organically developed curriculum initiatives and chats on specific topics (via hashtags).
- The Close Relationship Between Learning and Practice
  - Materials provided and shared are for all members of CoP (often via wikis and blogs from the members of the CoP).

Future Considerations

- Potential of learning online (in informal, grassroots settings) is there, it is now time to expand and develop this environment for learning.
- How to get more teachers to participate:
  - Access and engagement are prerequisites.

Conclusions

- Study shows how a grassroots informal collaborative web technology facilitated the learning of world language (WL) teachers with a new and progressive form of PD.
- Online, informal communities of dispersed groups of teachers can support learning in a variety of ways.
- Reinforces connections between the theoretical framework of CoPs, teacher professional development, and a sociocultural perspective on learning that have been established in previous work (Clarke & Claire, 2009, Cuddapah & Clayton, 2011), while offering evidence that this also applies to grassroots CoPs grounded in collaborative web technologies such as Twitter.

Discussion Questions:

1. How might online tools such as Twitter enhance teacher learning in our school-based partnerships or pre-service teacher preparation?
2. What forms of research are useful for studying teacher learning in new media environments?
3. When should one conduct ethnography? When should you employ design-based approaches? Hypothesis-testing methods?