Information for the January 29, 2016 TeachingWorks Journal Club Meeting

We will discuss the following two articles in this meeting:

1. Conklin, H.G. (2015). Preparing novice teacher educators in the pedagogy of teacher education. *Action in Teacher Education*, *37*(4): 317-333.

2. Zion, S., Allen, C. and C. Jean (2015). Enacting a critical pedagogy, influencing teachers' sociopolitical development. *The Urban Review*, *47*(5): 914-933.

In addition, bibliographic information is below for other relevant articles published in the following journals between October 15, 2015 and December 15, 2015.[1]

Action in Teacher Education
American Educational Research Journal
Educational Evaluation and Policy Analysis
Elementary School Journal
Journal of Education for Teaching: International Research and Pedagogy
Journal of Teacher Education
Teachers College Record
Teaching and Teacher Education
Urban Review

--
Bjuland, R. and R. Mosvold (2015). Lesson study in teacher education: Learning from a challenging case. *Teaching and Teacher Education*, *52*: 83-90.

> Whereas most studies of lesson study in teacher education seem to report on success stories, this article investigates a challenging case. From an implementation of lesson study in Norwegian teacher education, we analyse data from a mathematics group that struggled with implementation. Analysis of data from group interviews, mentoring sessions and teaching the research lesson indicates that several crucial aspects of lesson study were missing. The student teachers did not formulate a research question for their research lesson, they did not focus on observing pupil learning, and their lesson was not organised to make pupil learning visible.

Blazar, D. and M.A. Kraft (2015). Exploring mechanisms of effective teacher coaching: A tale of two cohorts from a randomized experiment. *Educational Evaluation and Policy Analysis*, *37*(4): 542-566.

> Although previous research has shown that teacher coaching can improve teaching practices and student achievement, little is known about specific features of effective coaching programs. We estimate the impact of MATCH Teacher Coaching (MTC) on a range of teacher practices using a blocked randomized trial and explore how changes in the coaching model across two cohorts are related to program effects. Findings indicate large positive effects in Cohort 1 but no effects in

---

Cohort 2. After ruling out explanations related to the research design, a set of exploratory analyses suggest that differential treatment effects may be attributable to differences in coach effectiveness, coaching dosage, and the focus of coaching across cohorts.

Burns, R.W. and B.J. Badiali (2015). When supervision is conflated with evaluation: Teacher candidates' perceptions of their novice supervisor. *Action in Teacher Education*, *37*(4): 418-437.

> Preparing teachers in clinically rich contexts requires teacher educators who are skilled and knowledgeable about university coursework as well as the complexities of classrooms. Retired teachers or principals have often assumed the role of field supervisor, bringing to their work extensive practitioner knowledge but often lacking theoretical knowledge of supervision. This qualitative case study examined the first-year experience of a reassigned teacher in the formal role of supervisor in a professional development school (PDS) context by analyzing the multiple perspectives of those affected by her supervisory practices. The purpose of this article is to discuss her interns' perspectives and the impact of her supervision on them. The findings show that this supervisor conflated the functions of supervision and evaluation, and as a result, her interns felt distress, disconnection, and disempowerment. The findings suggest that supervisors need a combination of practical and theoretical knowledge about supervision and that supervisors' professional learning warrants attention.

Colwell, J. and M.C. Enderson (2016). "When I hear literacy": Using pre-service teachers' perceptions of mathematical literacy to inform program changes in teacher education. *Teaching and Teacher Education*, *53*: 63-74.

> This case study investigated pre-service teachers' (PSTs) perceptions of disciplinary, or mathematical, literacy and factors related to their teacher education program at a public research university that influenced these perceptions. Seven PSTs volunteered to participate in individual and focus group interviews. Analysis indicated that PSTs considered certain elements of literacy (i.e., communication, application, vocabulary) to be important in mathematics education, but PSTs felt that literacy coursework did little to support their understanding of mathematical literacy. PSTs also discussed barriers present in mathematics methods coursework that hindered their understanding of mathematical literacy instruction and their ability to incorporate such instruction.

da Graça Nicoletti Mizukami, M., Maria de Medeiros Rodrigues Reali, A. and R. Maria Simões Tancredi (2015). Construction of professional knowledge of teaching: Collaboration between experienced primary school teachers and university teachers through an online mentoring programme. *Journal of Education for Teaching*, *41*(5): 493-513.

> This paper is related to an investigation carried out by researchers from a Brazilian public institution (Federal University of São Carlos) and experienced elementary school teachers. It adopts a research and intervention methodology developed in an online continuing teacher education programme, whose aims were the development of mentoring activities to help novice teachers to lighten their everyday professional difficulties. The intertwined research questions could be formulated as: (a) what contributions the participation of mentors in a research group could offer in their professional development processes? (b) How these mentors appropriate the current knowledge in the area in order to have theoretical and methodological tools for their management of beginning teachers? and (c) How they make explicit their professional practical knowledge? The online mentoring programme has promoted the establishment of professional and affective bonds among the participants, the broadening of professional knowledge, the collaboration among peers, the mastery of online adult education technologies and the participants' professional growth. It should be noted that it has been a much more complex enterprise than a face-to-face equivalent programme would have been because it demands entirely new logistics and some challenges. This text focuses on the learning of mentors as well

as the potential of the investigative tools used considering the professional development of mentors, as well as a way to comprehend such process.

Dvir, N. (2015). Does physical disability affect the construction of professional identity? Narratives of student teachers with physical disabilities. *Teaching and Teacher Education*, *52*: 56-65.
>This article uses case studies of student teachers with physical disabilities to examine their attitudes toward teaching students with disabilities, and the construction of their professional identity. Narrative analysis of their life stories shows a process of identity formation that begins with a sense of failure and exclusion early in life, continues through a turning point, and concludes with a sense of professional self-efficacy and ability to empower their students, whether with or without disabilities. The article also highlights the unique contribution of student teachers with physical disabilities to their colleagues, teacher-training institutions, and the professional community of educators.

Edwards, A.R., Sandoval, C. and H. McNamara (2015). Designing for improvement in professional development for community college developmental mathematics faculty. *Journal of Teacher Education*, *66*(5): 466-481.
>More than 60% of the nation's 14 million community college students are required to complete at least one developmental mathematics class before enrolling in college-credit courses; however, 80% of them do not successfully complete any college-level mathematics course within 3 years. To address this problem, the Community College Pathways initiative was launched in 2009. A core element is the Pathways Faculty Support Program, professional development aimed at supporting faculty to develop knowledge, beliefs, skills, and practices for teaching Pathways courses. In fall 2014, a redesign of the program used improvement science methods to design an infrastructure for responsive, flexible professional development that is sensitive to varying and changing conditions, with mechanisms for identifying, designing, and testing ideas for improvement. Specifically, our team employed a user-centered design process that foregrounds the needs and work processes of Pathways faculty and a measurement system that drives the continuous improvement of the program.

Ermeling, B., Tatsui, T. and K. Young (2015). Virtual coaching for instructional leaders: A multi-method investigation of technology-enabled external assistance. *Teachers College Record*, *117*(11): 1-48.
>**Background:** Education reforms over the last several decades have relied heavily on external assistance to help schools increase capacity for improving outcomes, but investing in sustained outside coaching and support is increasingly difficult with diminishing federal, state, and district resources. One under-investigated possibility for maintaining affordable external assistance is to leverage new virtual technologies.
>**Purpose:** This proof-of-concept study explored the potential of virtual coaching as a means for providing a cost effective, alternative model of ongoing external assistance to principals and leadership teams engaged in collaborative instructional improvement.
>**Intervention:** Researchers adapted an existing assistance framework from an established instructional improvement model, with published studies of effectiveness in the traditional face-to-face context, and substituted virtual methods of coaching and support for ongoing monthly settings with school leaders.
>**Research Design:** The study used a mixed-methods design, including video-recorded meetings, rubric-based coding and ratings, interviews, focus groups, and coaching logs to investigate implementation at three elementary and two middle schools during one full academic year.
>**Findings:** Evidence suggests that the blended coaching model served as an adequate and cost-effective substitute for traditional face-to-face coaching at all five pilot schools. The virtual coaching format was particularly effective for conducting one-on-one planning meetings with

principals and served as a catalyst to expand principals' growth and ownership of the instructional improvement process. The authors also document several challenges that emerged related to limitations of human interaction in the virtual context.

Conclusions: Findings suggest that blended or virtual models are worth consideration as one potential solution for maintaining external support in the midst of diminishing fiscal resources. For schools with verified leadership and technology readiness, the availability of virtual models might translate to greater distribution of outside expertise across a wider number of schools, or enable some funds to be repurposed for other critical priorities. Findings also have implications for the design of external assistance programs and services. Evidence from the study highlights distinct benefits of the virtual format, which might enable more strategic distribution of monthly support, increase capacity building, and improve access to high-quality expertise. Lastly, findings provide guidance for research and policy around technology-supported professional learning, pointing to the importance of aligning solutions with contexts, attending to sound quality and room configuration, and addressing challenges with the naturalness of interaction.

Gomez, K., Gomez, L.M., Rodela, K.C., Horton, E.S., Cunningham, J. and R. Ambrocio (2015). Embedding language support in developmental mathematics lessons: Exploring the value of design as professional development for community college mathematics instructors. *Journal of Teacher Education*, *66*(5): 450-465.

Three community college faculty members used improvement science techniques to design, develop, and refine contextualized developmental mathematics lessons, where language and literacy pedagogy and related supports figured prominently in these instructional materials. This article reports on the role that their design experiences played in professional learning. The article uses a model of professional learning developed by Clarke and Hollingsworth (2002) as the lens to describe and analyze their experiences. Results indicated theoretically noteworthy variation among the faculty. The results highlight a strong connection between faculty willingness to experiment, during trial enactment of these lessons, in their classrooms and faculty growth in knowledge and belief structures about the importance of language and literacy to mathematics teaching and learning. Implications for design-based development, as an important ongoing professional development activity for mathematics instructors, are discussed.

Guerra, N.S., Hernandez, A., Hector, A.M. and S. Crosby (2015). Listen-Identify-Brainstorm-Reality-Test-Encourage (LIBRE) problem-solving model: Addressing special education teacher attrition through a cognitive-behavioral approach to teacher induction. *Action in Teacher Education*, *37*(4): 334-354.

Special education teacher attrition rates continue to challenge the profession. A cognitive-behavioral problem-solving approach was used to examine three alternative certification program special education teachers' professional development through a series of 41 interviews conducted over a 2-year period. Beginning when they were novice special educators, we collected information concerning what they identified as problems and whether their demonstrated self-awareness about problem solving might influence their professional persistence. As would be expected, analyses suggest, these teachers demonstrated more deliberate, active, and self-directed problem solving at the end of data collection than at the beginning. This self-awareness may facilitate teacher sense of control and problem-solving efficacy and thus may increase the likelihood that novice special educators will remain in the field.

Hagans, K.S. and K. Powers (2015). Measuring credential candidates' impact on student achievement. *Action in Teacher Education*, *37*(4): 355-372.

The Council for the Accreditation of Educator Preparation (CAEP) requires faculty from educator preparation programs to provide evidence of credential candidates' impact on K-12 student learning. However, there is a paucity of information on preparation programs' use of direct

assessments of student learning to gauge credential candidate effectiveness and engage in a continuous cycle of program improvement. Rather, measures of impact consist primarily of indirect estimates, such as results from licensure exams, supervisor evaluations, and classroom observations. This article describes the use of single-subject research design as a method of assessing the impact of credential candidates on K-12 student learning, especially as it relates to meeting the instructional and behavioral needs of diverse students. Implications for how this evaluation approach may be applied to a wide array of commonly targeted K-12 student skills, and employed within a broader program evaluation system are discussed.

Hedin, L. and G. Conderman (2015). Shared promises and challenges of coteaching: General-special education and mentor preservice partnerships. *Action in Teacher Education*, *37*(14): 397-417.
Coteaching has two important but different applications in schools. First, coteaching between in-service general and special educators provides support for students with disabilities included in general education settings. Second, coteaching between cooperating or mentor teachers and their student teachers provides support for student teachers in developing their professional competencies. Using the term coteaching to describe these two applications often confuses teacher candidates as well as university and school personnel. Therefore, teachers, school administrators, and university personnel need clarification and understanding of these two applications including (1) their purposes, (2) positive outcomes, (3) factors that facilitate their success and (4) barriers that prevent success. In this descriptive article, the authors reflect on these two coteaching applications and their implications for teacher educators. The authors draw illustrations from recent studies in the research literature and their own experience in higher education with current coteachers and preservice teacher candidates. The authors conclude that though the two applications of coteaching differ in some aspects, they hold promise for informing and enhancing each other.

Hoffman, J.V., Wetzel, M.M., Maloch, B., Greeter, E., Taylor, L., DeJulio, S. and S.K. Vlach (2015). What can we learn from studying the coaching interactions between cooperating teachers and preservice teachers? A literature review. *Teaching and Teacher Education*, *52*: 99-112.
This research review focuses on studies that have examined the coaching interactions of cooperating teachers and preservice teachers around practice in teacher education programs. The review is situated inside of the practice-based turn in teacher education where the focus is on teaching as learning through practice and the crucial role that cooperating teachers play in mediating this learning. Forty-six studies were identified as meeting the criteria for inclusion. The analysis of these studies yielded a total of fourteen findings with varying levels of support. These findings are clustered in four areas: current practices and conditions; innovations in practice; relationships and tensions; and local contexts and teaching practices. The findings point to the need for stronger theoretical framing of the work of cooperating teachers in supporting teacher development and to the need for teacher education as a whole to be more proactive and responsible in the preparation of cooperating teachers.

Izadinia, M. (2015). A closer look at the role of mentor teachers in shaping preservice teachers' professional identity. *Teaching and Teacher Education*, *52*: 1-10.
This paper focuses on the extent to which mentoring relationships played a role in creating changes in the professional identity of seven preservice teachers. Semi-structured interviews, observations and reflective journals were used to document the changes experienced by participants as they went through their two placements during their one-year teacher education course. The data indicated that when the mentoring relationships were positive and expectations were met, preservice teachers felt more confident as a teacher. However, for some participants,

who experienced a partially negative mentoring relationship, their confidence declined and they felt they did not improve. Implications for practice are discussed.

Jacobs, J., Yendol-Hoppey, D. and N.F. Dana (2015). Preparing the next generation of teacher educators: The role of practitioner inquiry. *Action in Teacher Education*, *37*(4): 373-396.

Although the NCATE Blue Ribbon Panel Report challenges those responsible for teacher preparation to design clinically rich programs, there is little discussion about preparing teacher educators to actualize these innovations. This study explored how practitioner inquiry could serve as a mechanism to facilitate the development of the next generation of teacher educators. The purpose of this qualitative study was to understand what 16 doctoral student participants, from across two different university contexts, learned about becoming teacher educators as a result of engaging in practitioner inquiry. Findings suggest doctoral students developed an appreciation of inquiry as a tool for continuous instructional improvement and became active in program innovation. Doctoral students also broadened their understanding of educational research while uncovering tensions related to conducting research. These findings suggest inquiry as a relevant action for doctoral students to develop their abilities to innovate their own teaching, innovate programs, and conduct research at the institutions where they are completing their degree work as well as in their future work as teacher educators postgraduation. Findings also promote a discussion about current methods for teacher educator preparation, the future of the teacher educator role, and what constitutes research in teacher education.

Lincove, J.A., Osborne, C., Mills, N. and L. Bellows (2015). Teacher preparation for profit or prestige: Analysis of a diverse market for teacher preparation. *Journal of Teacher Education*, *66*(5): 415-434.

With increasing awareness of the importance of teacher quality for student learning, education policy leaders have turned their attention to the nation's teacher training programs as a potential target for reform. One proposed strategy is to increase competition for university-based programs by encouraging new program types. This study examines the relative effectiveness of universities and new program types using the diverse market in Texas. We examine program effectiveness through a framework integrating certificate pathways, organizational goals, and market incentives. We find that independent nonprofits have positive effects on student performance in math that are not explained by teacher sorting or program selectivity. Effects of program types vary across student and school demographics, and some types are particularly effective with high-risk populations. However, some program types are not available to all schools, and thus small differences between program types do not justify focusing reforms on any one type of program.

Martin, W.G. and H. Gobstein (2015). Generating a networked improvement community to improve secondary mathematics teacher preparation: Network leadership, organization, and operation. *Journal of Teacher Education*, *66*(5): 482-493.

The Mathematics Teacher Education Partnership (MTE-Partnership) was formed to address the undersupply of new secondary mathematics teachers who are well prepared to help their students attain the goals of the Common Core State Standards and other college- and career-ready standards. This national consortium of more than 90 universities and 100 school systems has been organized as a Networked Improvement Community (NIC), which combines the disciplined inquiry of improvement science with the power of networking to accelerate improvement by engaging a broad set of participants. Initiating a NIC involves a number of challenges described in the NIC Initiation Framework. This case study analyzes the MTE-Partnership's progress in one domain of that framework: network leadership, organization, and operation. Areas of discussion include convening the network, establishing a membership framework and participation structures, building leadership and hub functions, developing a communications infrastructure, and finding necessary resources.

McLean Davies, L., Dickson, B., Rickards, F., Dinham, S., Conroy, J. and R. Davis (2015). Teaching as a clinical profession: Translational practices in initial teacher education – An international perspective. *Journal of Education for Teaching*, *41*(5): 514-528.

> In response to evidence that teacher quality has the greatest in-school impact on student learning, and the consequent need for reform of intial teacher education, clinical approaches to the preparation of pre-service teachers have gained international prominence since the turn of the twenty-first century. This adaptation of medical discourse for the preparation of teachers has presented a new paradigm for teacher preparation and professional learning: a key tenet of this approach is the "translation" and application of theory and research in the sites of practice. This paper will explore the ways in which two clinical pre-service teacher preparation programme, The Master of Teaching at the University of Melbourne and the Partnership Model at the University of Glasgow, utilise clinical approaches to develop the research-informed practice of pre-service teachers working at designated clinical sites (schools). A central aspect of this paper is a discussion of the ways in which the medical metaphor and its consequent models can be effectively translated into different national contexts, and the affordances and appropriations required when undertaking this cross-disciplinary work.

Miller, K. and R. Shifflet (2016). How memories of school inform preservice teachers' feared and desired selves as teachers. *Teaching and Teacher Education*, *53*: 20-29.

> Elementary preservice teachers (N = 69) were asked to write about their memories of elementary school and reflect on the meaning of those memories in combination with course material. Based on the theory-driven thematic analysis, students reported memories that worked to create their desired and/or feared teacher self. Some students recognized a conflict between their memories and the effective teaching practices learned in the course, and only a few were able to negotiate their past memories with current practices and describe a plan of action. Findings elucidate the power of memories as preservice teachers prepare for the classroom.

O'Meara, J.G., Whiting, S. and T. Steele-Maley (2015). The contribution of teacher effectiveness maps and the TACTICS framework to teacher leader professional learning. *Journal of Education for Teaching*, *41*(5): 529-540.

> Improving the quality of learning outcomes for all learners represents a major target for the organisers of the 2015 World Education Forum in Korea. Enhancing the effectiveness of what teachers do in the classrooms is a key strategy for reaching this target. This paper seeks to provide some insights into the use of Teacher Effectiveness Maps (TEMs) and the associated targeting, analysing, contextualising, translating, interpreting, changing, suggesting (TACTICS) framework as strategies for educators and governments seeking to document the nature and impact of professional learning activities for improving the quality of learning outcomes for all learners. The USA's concept of "Teacher Leader" and principles teacher professional learning provide a conceptual lens for interpreting the impact of using these strategies. Despite the limitations of a pilot size of two, the results offer some useful insights about designing and documenting teacher leader professional learning activities for improving the quality of learning outcomes for all learners. The authors identify the integration of collaborative teacher leader professional learning and the use of TEMs as promising practices for improving the quality of learning for all learner in the post-2015 era among the benefits linked to this research agenda.

Ottley, J.R., Piasta, S.B., Mauck, S.A., O'Connell, A., Weber-Mayrer, M. and L.M. Justice (2015). The nature and extent of change in early childhood educators' language and literacy knowledge and beliefs. *Teaching and Teacher Education*, *52*: 47-55.

> Professional development (PD) can enhance educators' knowledge and beliefs, but research has yet to determine the nature and extent of such change. This study examined the patterns and

predictors of change in knowledge and beliefs for early childhood educators participating in state-implemented PD. Results from a longitudinal piecewise growth model indicated that educators improved their knowledge and beliefs to varying extents during the school year when PD was provided. Change then plateaued with educators neither improving nor regressing during the subsequent school year. Openness to change and self-efficacy significantly predicted knowledge and beliefs, respectively. Research and practice implications are provided.

Saloviita, T. (2015). Measuring pre-service teachers' attitudes towards inclusive education: Psychometric properties of the TAIS scale. *Teaching and Teacher Education*, *52*: 66-72.
> The Teachers' Attitudes towards Inclusive Education (TAIS) scale was designed to measure pre-service teachers' attitudes towards inclusion, as defined in the Salamanca Statement of UNESCO. The 10-item scale was developed using a sample of 185 final-year pre-service subject teachers. It was validated in four subsequent studies with various samples of teachers and pre-service teachers. The unidimensionality of the scale was established in all samples except the first-year students, and its validity was confirmed in psychometric analyses. The scale is suggested for use in intervention studies aiming to develop positive attitudes towards inclusion among teachers and pre-service teachers.

Guiding Ideas for Journal Club on January 29, 2016:

Our two articles fall into a broader realm of research that focuses on the role of teacher education in preparing teachers for schools in which they will be teaching across difference and encountering issues of inequality. In the first article, Conklin proposes a framework for preparing novice teacher educators to prepare pre-service teachers to be competent (e.g. strong pedagogical content knowledge, classroom management), justice-oriented, and ready to teach diverse learners. In the second article, Zion, Allen, and Jean describe how in-service teachers experienced sociopolitical development through a curriculum that engaged them in critical pedagogy, such that their own teaching practice began to encourage students to act against oppressive systems. Taken together, these two articles lead us to the following through-lines for this discussion:

- Change agents: Both articles suggest that it is crucial for teachers to increase self-awareness through educational experiences that unearth their own assumptions and beliefs that might impact their teaching. In both articles, awareness is a key first step toward becoming a change-agent or developing a justice-oriented teaching practice. We might consider:
    - Can teachers become change-agents? Should we expect teachers to become change-agents (i.e. we as in teacher educators, researchers, citizens)?
    - How could teacher educators prepare teachers to become change-agents?
- Practice of teacher education: Both articles imply that teachers will enact practices and embody ideas if they have the chance to *experience those practices and ideas as a student first*.
    - What kinds of learning experiences in teacher education translate into teaching practice?
    - How do teacher educators' theories about their students guide their teaching--their practices, their decisions, their goals?
- Preparing teacher educators *to prepare teachers* to be change-agents:
    - To develop a justice or change-agent orientation in K-12 teachers, what do teacher educators need to know, do, or believe?

Conklin, H.G. (2015). Preparing novice teacher educators in the pedagogy of teacher education. *Action in Teacher Education*, *37*(4): 317-333.

Abstract: In this article, the author provides a conceptual framework to guide the design of coursework to prepare teacher educators. Given the absence of a stronger research base to inform the preparation of novice teacher educators, the author argues that theoretical perspectives focused on K-12 preservice teacher learning can be a useful heuristic for decision making in a course for novice teacher educators. To illustrate the application of this framework, the author provides examples from a course on the pedagogy of teacher education oriented toward critical, social justice-oriented pedagogies that the author created and taught to a group of doctoral students who were learning to become teacher educators. By illustrating how the preservice teacher learning framework she proposes guided her own course decision making, the author aims to provide others with a guiding framework for facilitating the learning of novice teacher educators.

Summary prepared by: Hillary Greene

Purpose / Motivation of the Article
In this article, Conklin shares a framework for a course to prepare novice teacher educators ("NTEs") to prepare pre-service teachers ("PSTs"), which she developed as a result of her work as an educator of novice teacher educators ("ENTE"). She emphasizes that the framework should serve less as a recipe for other ENTEs to adopt and more as an illustration of the necessity of clear, formal, course-based preparation that NTEs need but often do not receive. In addition, Conklin's framework focuses on preparing NTEs to be justice-oriented practitioners--so that they will in turn prepare PSTs to also be justice-oriented practitioners. Conklin's motivations in writing this article were to:

- share a detailed framework for preparing NTEs, which other ENTEs could use as a guide
- show what theories guide her work as an ENTE, since she feels it was particularly useful for her to think about theories of PST learning as a guide for her own practice as an ENTE
- call for more formal, purposeful, research-based, and justice-oriented preparation of NTEs to address issues of inequity at the K-12 level

Research Question
Conklin did not explicitly state a research question. That said, she stated her aims as follows:

> Thus, building on the need for further research into and conceptualization of curricular approaches to preparing NTEs—and particularly those oriented toward critical, social justice-oriented pedagogies—in this article, I propose a framework to guide the design and implementation of formal coursework to prepare teacher educators for skilled teacher education practice. (p. 318)

Research Context
The framework Conklin generates stems from a doctoral level course she taught in 2009 to a group of NTEs at a southern university. While teaching the course, Conklin had explicit goals: "To provide doctoral students with conceptual and practical tools for understanding and enacting teacher education practice, focusing on a vision of compassionate, critical, justice-oriented teacher education and the particular teacher education pedagogies that might support this vision" (p. 319). After teaching the course, she realized that her preparation of NTEs was guided implicitly by a theory of PST learning. For her, this theory included the elements of PST learning outlined in the table below (e.g. that PST learning occurs in a sociopolitical context, that PSTs learn pedagogy in part through the pedagogies used in teacher education ("TE"). In this way, this article spans from the teaching context in which the NTE course took

place in 2009 to the research context, which produced this reflection and analysis several years later. The theoretical frame that Conklin uses is summarized in the second column of the table below. She draws both on the literature cited there, as well as on her own experience as an ENTE.

Findings: A Framework for Preparing Teacher Educators
A key theme in Conklin's framework is her underlying belief that what occurs in the preparation of NTEs can ultimately affect K12 teaching and learning. In particular, if a justice orientation is the focus in the preparation of NTEs, she hopes it will travel from TE into K12 settings. For example, by giving NTEs in her course the opportunity to explore their own identities as teacher educators, Conklin argues that they will learn how to help PSTs unpack their identities as teachers; in turn, PSTs will appreciate that children enter classrooms with their own identities that need careful consideration in teaching practice (p. 322). In the table below, I summarize and paraphrase Conklin's framework, including how she conceptualizes PST learning (and some main research she cites) and how that guided her practice as an ENTE. Note that although Conklin cites other literature at points to support her theory, she does not discuss it in detail.

Framework Component	*Theory*: How Conklin conceptualizes the component in the context of **PST learning** (Cited literature is listed in order of appearance in Conklin's writing)	*Practice*: How Conklin used or envisions using the component to guide **NTE learning + ENTE teaching**
1. Social Context	● PST (and K12, and NTE) learning occurs in a sociopolitical context (personal characteristics>>institutional context>>state context>>nation) (cites Zeichner & Gore, 1990)	● ENTEs need to consider NTEs' own sociopolitical contexts ● ENTEs need to consider how NTEs will understand PSTs' sociopolitical contexts ● Coursework should require NTEs to explore their own sociopolitical identity, and to consider how they will get PSTs to explore theirs ● *Activity example: NTEs analyze an assignment Conklin gives PSTs to describe a past learning experience they had and contrast it with the learning experience of a person who is culturally, linguistically, socioeconomically different from them*
2. Who?	● PSTs bring to TE identities and experiences that need exploration (cites Feiman-Nemser & Remillard, 1995; Darling-Hammond, Hammerness, Grossman, Rust & Shulman, 2005; Lortie, 1975)	● NTEs' existing ideas about TE need exploration ● NTEs need to learn ways to get to know their PSTs and the ideas they have about teaching ● *Activity example: Conklin begins her NTE course by having NTEs write about their own opinions on and experiences in TE, both to surface their own ideas and to see how they could unearth PSTs' ideas about teaching*
3. When and Where?	● PSTs learn about teaching from their first day of K12 to the end of their career (Feiman-Nemser & Remillard, 1995; Lortie, 1975)	● ENTEs should know what NTEs have learned about TE (in their program, in their past, etc.) ● *Example: Be aware of other TE courses*

4. Purposes (Why?)	● PSTs encounter in TE (and elsewhere) ideas of what the purposes of teaching are (Zeichner & Conklin, 2008; Zeichner & Gore, 1990; McDonald, 2007)	● ENTEs' vision of teaching should be clear to themselves and NTEs ● ENTEs should also help NTEs figure out what vision of teaching they hope to develop in PSTs ● *Example: Conklin made her justice-oriented purposes of teaching clear to NTEs*
5. What?	● PSTs learn an explicit and an implicit curriculum in TE ● PSTs should leave TE with conceptual and practical tools and justice-oriented dispositions (Hammerness et al. 2005; Feiman-Nemser & Remillard, 1995; Grossman et al., 1999; Grossman, 2005)	● ENTEs should have clear goals for what tools and dispositions NTEs need to be effective ● *Example: Conklin assigned NTEs readings on TE pedagogies to serve as practical tools for NTEs' work with PSTs (e.g. rehearsals, cases)* ● *Example: Conklin had NTEs analyze assignments she had given PSTs in the past to identify what conceptual and practical tools were involved, what goals she intended, etc.*
6. How?	● PSTs learn their own pedagogy in part through pedagogy employed in TE (Borko & Putnam, 1996; Hammerness et al., 2005; Ball & Forzani, 2009)	● Pedagogy trickles down: ENTEs should employ sound pedagogy that NTEs can use, which in turn PSTs can use with K12 students ● *Example: Conklin describes always debriefing with NTEs about her own teaching (e.g. what worked, what did not), hoping that NTEs absorb debriefing as a practice to use when teaching PSTs; in turn, debriefing will enter PSTs' own practice with K12 students; at all levels from TE to K12, debriefing creates a culture of fairness and openness about the learning process*

Note: Component titles in this table are verbatim from Conklin's framework; the remainder is paraphrased based on Conklin's description of her framework at pp. 321-329. The literature cited is listed in order of appearance in each section of Conklin's article; in some cases, she cites more research than is listed here, but I have listed the main works she cites for each section.

Conclusions and Implications
Conklin's framework is a call for more intentional preparation of NTEs, guided by theory and research, with an eye toward equity and opportunity for all children. She does not specify which theories or research need to guide ENTEs but urges that programs prepare teachers in *some* formal way. She grounded her work as an ENTE in her theory of PST learning for social justice-oriented K12 teaching, in order to ensure that PSTs are prepared for the challenges of effectively teaching diverse learners. She shows that the way we prepare NTEs trickles down into our K12 classrooms (see example above about acknowledging and unpacking diverse identities at all levels of practice). Since the practices and beliefs of NTEs influence PSTs, she argues for intentionality in how ENTEs prepare NTEs. Without such intentional framing, especially around teaching for social justice, the subtext of Conklin's argument is that children will be stuck with unfair and unequal educational opportunities.

Possible Questions for Further Consideration
● Does it seem plausible that ideas emphasized in a course for NTEs will influence NTE, PST, or K12 teaching practices?
● How do our TE programs approach the preparation of NTEs and the development or surfacing of their ideas about teaching?

Zion, S., Allen, C. and C. Jean (2015). Enacting a critical pedagogy, influencing teachers' sociopolitical development. *The Urban Review*, *47*(5): 914-933.

Abstract: *Historically marginalized students continue to experience opportunity gaps in our schools and inequities in their communities. To change these contexts, we want students to develop the skills, mindsets, and ability to act against oppression. In order for that to occur, educators must have support and opportunities to learn and practice acting as agents of change against oppression in the educational system. This challenge is particularly salient given that a majority of teachers are White and middle class, and thus have different backgrounds from the youth they seek to support. This exploratory study examined whether and how educators who participated in a project called critical civic inquiry (CCI) experienced sociopolitical development. Data including video observations, written assignments, online discussion boards, and individual interviews. The paper focuses on the experiences of five White educators in urban middle schools who participated in a yearlong CCI course, which was designed to support them in implementing critical pedagogy, student voice, sociopolitical development, and participatory action research in their classrooms. In this paper, we discuss how enacting a critical pedagogy as a participant in CCI may have impacted the sociopolitical development of teachers.*

Summary prepared by: Shanyce L. Campbell

Purpose of the Study

Scholars have examined various ways in which educators can meet the academic and schooling experiences of underserved student populations; however, none, according to the authors, have explicitly considered "how, or if, sociopolitical development happens in White teachers (p. 918)." This study fills this gap in the literature, by examining how the participation of five White teachers in the Critical Civic Inquiry (CCI) project helped to develop a sociopolitical discourse through the teachers' use of critical pedagogy in their K-12 classrooms. As a part of their sociopolitical development, these White teachers were challenged to: recognize their own identity within systems of power and privilege; uncover how the education system creates and perpetuates oppression; and develop skills to take action against forms of oppression. Built around anti-racist education and sociopolitical development, the CCI project provided teachers with opportunities to learn and practice acting as agents of change against oppression in the education system.

Key terms:
- Critical Civic Inquiry (CCI) – "Emphasizes sharing power with students, engaging students in critical conversations about educational equity, and guiding students through action research" (p. 916).

- Critical Pedagogy – "Aims to challenge cultural and structural power relations (Freire, 1970) through an analysis of these systems of power (such as practices within schools)" (p. 916).

- Anti-racist Education – Is "an action-oriented strategy for institutional, systemic change to address racism and the interlocking systems of social oppression" (p. 916; Dei, 1996, p. 25).

- Sociopolitical Development (SPD) – "A frame for thinking about the process by which people take what they have learned about themselves, society, and inequities, and use that knowledge, along with developed skills and abilities that allow them to take action against oppression" (p917).

Background of the CCI

The Critical Civic Inquiry is a project developed by Ben Kirshner, Shelley Zion, and Carlos Hipolito-Delgado that partners with secondary teachers to engage students in action oriented research designed to bring about equity-based reform across schools. As a part of CCI, teachers took a year-long course that included trainings, readings, peer discussion and teaching observations. Teacher/participants were asked to complete an autobiography, develop a curricular unit integrating their course content with CCI activities, and facilitate an action research project.

Research Question

How does enacting a critical pedagogy through the implementation of a Critical Civic Inquiry (CCI) curriculum support teachers in becoming sociopolitical actors?

Research Participants

Five in-service teachers who enrolled in the CCI course volunteered to participate in the study. The research participants were all White, entered teaching through an alternative licensure program, taught in Title I urban middle schools, and were in their first 3 years of teaching. Two taught literacy, two taught science, and one taught across content areas.

Data Collection and Analysis

The researchers collected two forms of data: course documents and interviews. Course documents included: final autobiographical papers, planning documents, curriculum units, lesson plans, activity sheets, discussion guides, final CCI project, and content from course discussion forums. Course documents were reviewed and coded to identify examples of the key elements from SPD. These elements include: understanding self within a system; understanding how systems perpetuate oppressions, and building skills to take action. The findings gathered from the analysis of course documents were then used to create an interview protocol for further exploration of teachers' experiences in the course and how they implemented CCI in their practice. Individual interviews were conducted between six and nine months after the completion of the CCI course.

Each course document was read in the order in which it was completed by the participant/teacher. Codes and subcodes were developed around three key elements of SPD: (1) teachers exploring their own identities; (2) understanding the broader social systems in which they and their students live; and (3) developing skills to make changes within those systems. Interviews were conducted after all course documents were coded. Interviews were used to fill in gaps from the course documents and to help the authors understand how and why participants decided to take the course and how CCI impacted them personally and professionally.

Results

Theme 1: Understanding of Self in Relation to Systems of Oppression
- In unpacking their privilege, teachers began to:
  - Name their privilege,
  - Examine how their privilege created biases regarding underserved people groups,
  - Identify the accumulation of unearned privileges, and
  - Understand how systems of privilege influence their relationships with their middle school students.

As an example, one study participated explained:

I carry my privilege, my middle-class upbringing, my all-White Nebraska ways with me. That doesn't go away because I live in the middle of a Latino neighborhood in

14

the Highlands. It doesn't disappear because I eat dinner at my students' homes. It doesn't vanish because I can speak a little Spanish, recite the most recent immigration talking points, or tell the difference between a breakfast burrito from Santiago's and one from Jack and Grill. That is the hardest hurdle to unpack—the one built inside myself. I still have a long way to go to unraveling all of the biases built up over the years. I hope to continue a cycle of awareness, evaluation, and correction to make those internal biases less prevalent. I have no illusions that they'll ever disappear forever, but I do think they will lessen as I become more culturally competent (pgs.922-3).

- Teachers emphasized how CCI made oppression more of a concrete construct rather than an abstract construct. That is, engaging in critical pedagogy where students' voices and experiences are heard and appreciated allowed teachers to understand school level data and statistics of their students through a different lens. As an example, one of the teachers in the study stated:

   I mean, it's made me more aware. It's made it more concrete, too. So, I feel like a lot of Masters classes and [our licensure program] say, "these are the forces at play", and you look at just like, the data from your school, the demographics, like "oh yeah, these forces are at play", but to like, empower Javier to tell his story is like so much more important. It's like, oh yeah, some kids are undocumented, or yeah, some kids are poor, but to like give them the forum, and give them the confidence to reclaim the story about themselves where they actually tell what it's like living that really inspires you and really lets you connect with kids on a whole new level. I mean, just like knowing my kids were undocumented and couldn't go to college, like just the vague faces, I don't know who it is, I mean, yeah. That's unfair. But knowing it's Javier who works his ass off and is a great kid, like that makes me want to keep doing this, do it better so Javier can get there, you know. The specificity of it, I think, really inspires you. I think putting a personal face on all that stuff, hearing the real stories from the kids actual pens and pencils is pretty awesome (p.924).

- Gaining critical pedagogy skills allowed teachers to:
    - See students not just as individuals, but as a part of a "racialized, gendered, and classed society (p.925)", and
    - Understand how systems impact students

Theme 2: Uncovering How Systems Harm Students
- Teachers became aware of systemic barriers experienced by their students and the ways in which White cultural ideologies of underserved students serve to "blame or marginalize the students" (p. 927). One teacher in the study illustrates this, stating:

   My students, with their brown skin and Latino sounding names, will continually have to prove themselves to their potential employers. They will have to prove they were smart enough to get into college, not just that they got a scholarship for being Latino. They will have to field endless comments about how they "made it," if they "make it" according to the White definition. If they don't, they will have to endure the look from American society that either ignores them or pities them. They will continual have to wrestle with boxing themselves in for other people and explaining their identity to others. Given the litany of fighting and explaining they will have to, it makes it difficult to leave the system as we have put it in place and even harder to fight for your community if you are able to (p.927).

15

Theme 3: Developing Skills to Take Action
- Teachers increased in their ability to:
  - Discuss issues of race and oppression
  - Listen and hear other people's perspectives
  - Create change and organize people to assist in creating change

A study participant summarized this finding, stating that:

> This project has also had a strong impact on my own development both culturally and civically. Through reflections on my personal beliefs, I was able to identify my own judgments and biases that may come into play in my classroom in interactions with students and parents. Before participating in this project, I was uneasy about the thought of engaging my students in difficult conversations about race and discrimination as a White woman. However, I was able to overcome this uneasiness and now find myself having these complicated conversations with students regularly and with great honesty. Sometimes it may make my students and me uncomfortable when dealing with these difficult issues in class; however, I believe that it's important that we be bothered by the inequities in society. I've also learned a lot about action research and community organizing that I did not know before working on this project. I've never before actually worked for change in an organization the way that I did with my students through this project, and I've found that my own civic identity has been strengthened through this participation as well. I'm now more confident in my ability to create change and more knowledgeable about how to organize people to help in that effort; that's been a great change for me in my development both personally and professionally (p. 928).

Discussion and Limitations
Overall, the authors found that the CCI coursework, coupled with the implementation of the coursework with K-12 students, allowed teachers to develop sociopolitical knowledge and skills to address inequities. Moreover, the programs' emphasis on the iterative process of learning, application and reflection (i.e. "the cycle of praxis") served as the basis for the development of teachers' sociopolitical discourse. Specifically, teachers experienced transformation in their thinking around their own racialized and privileged identities. This process also enabled teachers to understand how systematic oppression impacts the opportunities of their students. Overall, the teachers who participated in this study all experienced some SPD, which had an influence on their colleagues and schools, more broadly. Moreover, this intervention allowed teachers to understand the "urgency to work against oppression in the educational system on behalf of the kids they work with" (p. 930).

There were also several limitations that the authors mentioned in this study. First, the study did not follow teachers beyond 6-9 months after the course ended; therefore, it is unclear whether the SPD effects persist over time. Second, the authors acknowledged the study's potential selection bias issue, which stems from the fact that teachers volunteered to participate in the study. Therefore, study participants may have a proclivity toward understanding and working against issues of oppression prior to the intervention. Finally, the data used were based on self-reports; therefore, the findings may suffer from social desirability bias, whereby, participants provide responses that seem "correct."

Implications
The authors conclude by providing teacher education and professional development programs with several recommendations based on their findings:

- Embed opportunities to engage in explicit conversations and teaching about power, privilege, and systems of oppression in course and internship experiences, throughout teacher training programs, induction, and professional learning opportunities. Move away from the "one multicultural education course" model that is prevalent in many programs.
- Create an expectation of ongoing reflection and dialogue on these topics, with students, faculty, and school partners. Examine all coursework and assessment to ensure that these issues are foregrounded.
- Build the capacity of faculty and school personnel to engage in these conversations.
- Explicitly teach the skills that support a critical pedagogy.

Critiques

Aside from the limitations discussed in the paper, there are additional questions that were left unaddressed. First, while the authors write that participating teachers applied "techniques, ideas, and strategies with students in the classroom" and engaged in various types of reflections, the authors did not provide concrete examples of the techniques, ideas or strategies taught within the CCI intervention. Providing specific detail regarding the CCI activities would allow the readers a deeper understanding about the how the teachers experienced SPD. Moreover, it was unclear how these skills were applied in classrooms. Were participants taught a skill and then asked to demonstrate the skill in their classes or were participants allowed to freely implement certain skills and techniques? Which skills and techniques did they choose to implement and why?

Second, the authors explicitly indicate that a limitation in understanding the transformation of practice is that they do not follow teachers after the course ends.   However, I would challenge the authors to consider a critique of the study which stems from the fact that the authors did not capture participants' pre-course knowledge, skills, and dispositions about the key elements of SPD. In the discussion section of the paper the authors state that teachers contrasted "their teaching pre- and post-CCI" (p. 929). A more systematic examination of pre and post teaching practices would provide readers with a clear sense of the magnitude in which teachers and their instructional practices were transformed as a result of the program.

Finally, while a contribution of this study is the explicit focus on White, middle class teachers' SPD due to the largely White and middle class teaching profession, some discussion around teachers of color SPD is warranted. Without this discussion, the reader could be left wondering whether the authors believe SPD happens differently across racial, gendered, and classed groups? Moreover, should readers assume that teachers of color come into teaching with an inherent sociopolitical discourse?